

The regular meeting of the Historic Preservation and Architectural Review Board (HPARB) of the Village of Cooperstown was held in the Village Office Building, 22 Main Street, Cooperstown, New York on Tuesday, October 11, 2016. Members in attendance were Chair – Liz Callahan, Brian Alexander, David Sanford, Roger MacMillan and Mark Mershon. Fourteen members of the public were present.

Ms. Callahan called the meeting to order at 5:00 PM.

Regular Agenda

78 Fair Street (Dan/Solvay Glass for Karen Graham) – window replacement

Ms. Callahan inquired as to the composition of materials for the proposed replacement windows and noted that brochures were included with the applications with various elements circled, however, with no clear reference to window composition.

The owner representative noted that 40% is reclaimed wood fibers and 60% is a composite materials with a PVC exterior that is paintable.

Ms. Callahan noted that as the Village is on the National Historic Register and we are obliged to follow those guidelines and our law reads materials are to be replaced in kind. She stated wood windows should be replaced with wood windows and grills between the glass are not acceptable. She noted that simulated dividers in the windows have been approved.

Ms. Callahan stated that of the front and side windows noted for replacement the majority appear to be original. She stated that in visiting the home she was guessing at the windows to be replaced as the application was not specific and noted that the application should specify which windows are being replaced.

Mr. Sanford noted that the sashes of the windows at the home appear to be in decent shape.

The owner representative stated that the owner is seeking replacement windows as repairs to a sagging foundation have caused the current ones do not close properly.

The owner representative provided cut away samples of the proposed window replacement material and glass for Board review.

Mr. Alexander stated he sees no compelling reason that the windows cannot be replaced in kind.

Mr. Mershon added or that the original windows cannot be repaired.

The owner representative asked if the proposed window replacement would not fall under Number 7 in the Village window guidelines speaking to synthetic material. Ms. Callahan stated that the preference is that the materials be replaced in kind.

Ms. Callahan asked the owner representative to go back to the owner and ask if a repair contractor has been consulted by the owner to make repairs to the original windows. She stated that this is a very well maintained 1855 historic home and the goal is to see that it gets the attention that it deserves as a historic home.

34 Pioneer Street (Frank Leo, Tom Cassis and Steve Eldred) – replacement of southern porch, exterior stairs and steps

Ms. Callahan noted that the file did not contain any information regarding the project, other than an application stating repairs to exterior stairs.

Mr. Leo stated he has photographs and proposed materials for the Board's information.

Mr. Eldred stated that the steps and decking will be made of a composite material similar to "Trex" with stone facing. He stated that composite material replaces existing concrete steps and deck and will make it safer and last better as the water coming off the roof deteriorates the concrete. He stated the stone facing currently exists. Photographs of existing conditions were provided.

Mr. Leo stated that rather than having the steps coming directly down from the building to the street, they will be placed on the side to match the existing northern porch. He also noted that the wrought iron railing would be replaced with a steel railing. Mr. Eldred stated he did not have an example of the railing to be used as it is currently on loan to someone else from Bruce Hall.

Ms. Callahan stated that a complete application including material information, photographs and drawings are to be submitted at least one week prior to the meeting so members have adequate time to review and not have to make a decision on the fly.

Ms. Callahan noted that she has concerns over the combination of materials that the applicant is looking to use.

Dr. MacMillan stated he has no problem with the combination of materials.

Mr. Sanford stated that he is concerned about the aesthetic look and feels the northern porch should be replicated except replacing the composite decking for the bluestone on the southern porch. He also stated that a stipulation of approval should be made that an email be provided to the Board showing a picture of the railing to be used.

Mr. Sanford made a motion to adopt the following resolution for a Certificate of Appropriateness:

Action by the Village of Cooperstown, Historic Preservation and Architectural Review Board

Resolution date: October 11, 2016

A resolution to approve the proposed replacement of the southern steps of 34 Pioneer Street, Cooperstown, NY

WHEREAS the Historic Preservation and Architectural Review Board has made the following findings of fact concerning the proposed application:

- *A public hearing is not required;*
- *The requirements of SEQRA have been met for this action;*
- *The structure is listed as contributing in the Glimmerglass Historic District Nomination Form;*
- *The proposed work meets the criteria under Section 300-26.E. (2)(b), (2)(c), (3)(a), (3)(b), (3)(c), (3)(d and (5);*
- *In addition the following conditions must be met:*
 - *An email be sent to the Board of the railing materials and image prior to installation.*

Section 300-26 of the Zoning Law having been met with regards to the proposed work at 34 Pioneer Street;

NOW THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED, that we, the duly appointed members of the Historic Preservation and Architectural Review Board of the Village of Cooperstown do this 11th day of October, 2016, determine that the work at 34 Pioneer Street, Cooperstown, NY meets the criteria for work within the Historic and Architectural Control Overlay District as set forth in the Zoning Law of the Village of Cooperstown.

Mr. Merson seconded the motion and a vote on the motion had the following results:

AYES: Callahan, Alexander, Sanford, MacMillan, Mershon Motion carried.

The board determined this action to be a minor alteration for reporting purposes.

25 Brooklyn Avenue (Susan Snell for John/Barbara Rankin) – expansion of existing second floor “sleeping porch” into 4 season sun room

Mrs. Snell reviewed site plan submitted with the application. The materials to be used were reviewed.

Mr. Sanford noted that for the most part it cannot be seen from the street.

Mr. Sanford made a motion to adopt the following resolution for a Certificate of Appropriateness:

Action by the Village of Cooperstown, Historic Preservation and Architectural Review Board

Resolution date: October 11, 2016

A resolution to approve the proposed expansion of existing second floor sleeping porch into a 4 season sun room at 25 Brooklyn Avenue, Cooperstown, NY

WHEREAS the Historic Preservation and Architectural Review Board has made the following findings of fact concerning the proposed application:

- *A public hearing is not required;*
- *The requirements of SEQRA have been met for this action;*
- *The structure is listed as contributing in the Glimmerglass Historic District Nomination Form;*
- *The proposed changes cannot be seen from the street;*
- *The proposed changes are in keeping with the surrounding area;*
- *The proposed work meets the criteria under Section 300-26.E. (2)(a), (2)(b), (3)(a), (3)(b), (3)(c), (3)(d and (5);*

Section 300-26 of the Zoning Law having been met with regards to the proposed work at 25 Brooklyn Avenue;

NOW THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED, that we, the duly appointed members of the Historic Preservation and Architectural Review Board of the Village of Cooperstown do this 11th day of October, 2016, determine that the work at 25 Brooklyn Avenue, Cooperstown, NY meets the criteria for work within the Historic and Architectural Control Overlay District as set forth in the Zoning Law of the Village of Cooperstown.

Dr. MacMillan seconded the motion and a vote on the motion had the following results:

AYES: Callahan, Alexander, Sanford, MacMillan, Mershon Motion carried.

The board determined this action to be a minor alteration for reporting purposes.

CVS (Todd Hamula, Zaremba Group and Anthony Germanese, NORR) – revised elevations

Mr. Hamula provided design boards showing elevation views provided at last month's meeting and the revised elevation views being presented tonight.

Mr. Germanese stated that changes made from input received at last month's meeting include removing the brick base, removing the mansard roof, a steeper pitch to the gable roof, providing for 2 side gables and simplifying the design.

It was noted that the color has been changed due to the request of CVS.

Mr. Hamula noted that some of the features were pulled from the Thanksgiving Home and Railroad Avenue property.

Board members felt the pitch of the roof on the revised elevations was much better.

Ms. Callahan noted that she has a concern with the front and side gables being of different heights and feels the height should match. She also asked if the mechanicals could be moved from the rear elevation, which would face Beaver street, to the right elevation.

Board members also concurred that the color change is a big improvement.

Mr. Hamula noted that this will be a unique building for CVS as it is a completely new design.

Drawings will be revised for the next meeting showing gables of the same height and moving the mechanicals to the right elevation. Mr. Hamula noted that he will bring a material board with samples as well.

130 Chestnut Street (William Dykstra) – replace front porch and add second stair access to porch

Ms. Callahan noted that the application had been received today and asked the Board if they wished to proceed with review. Board consensus was to proceed.

Mr. Dykstra noted that a fire on the front porch occurred and he would like to continue with reconstruction of the front porch and add a second south stair access as he has driveways on both sides of the property.

He stated he is building with the same footprint and like materials and the only change is the double staircase and removal of asphalt shingles on front railing. He said the railing will change to painted cedar.

Ms. Callahan inquired if Mr. Dykstra intends to keep the architectural detail on the posts as is currently in place. He noted that he would be doing so and his drawing was revised to show the detail.

Discussion was held regarding the requested use of paintable PVC for trim around the posts. Ms. Callahan asked if they would match current dimensions. Mr. Dykstra stated he would keep current dimensions. Following discussion, stated he would not use the PVC as trim.

Mr. Mershon made a motion to adopt the following resolution for a Certificate of Appropriateness:

Action by the Village of Cooperstown, Historic Preservation and Architectural Review Board

Resolution date: October 11, 2016

A resolution to approve the proposed repairs to the front porch and addition of a second staircase at 130 Chestnut Street, Cooperstown, NY

WHEREAS the Historic Preservation and Architectural Review Board has made the following findings of fact concerning the proposed application:

- *A public hearing is not required;*
- *The requirements of SEQRA have been met for this action;*
- *The structure is listed as contributing in the Glimmerglass Historic District Nomination Form;*
- *The proposed work meets the criteria under Section 300-26.E. (2)(a), (2)(b), (2)(c), (3)(a), (3)(b), (3)(c), (3)(d and (5);*

Section 300-26 of the Zoning Law having been met with regards to the proposed work at 130 Chestnut Street;

NOW THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED, that we, the duly appointed members of the Historic Preservation and Architectural Review Board of the Village of Cooperstown do this 11th day of October, 2016, determine that the work at 130 Chestnut Street, Cooperstown, NY meets the criteria for work within the Historic and Architectural Control Overlay District as set forth in the Zoning Law of the Village of Cooperstown.

Mr. Merson seconded the motion and a vote on the motion had the following results:

AYES: Callahan, Alexander, Sanford, MacMillan, Mershon Motion carried.

The board determined this action to be a minor alteration for reporting purposes.

53 Pioneer Street (Toby McCarty) – update on engineering report

Mr. McCarty noted he is working with the group that is hoping to make restoration to 53 Pioneer Street.

He noted that it had been felt that an engineering report was forthcoming, but so far only a fee proposal has been submitted.

Mr. McCarty reviewed some ideas the group has for the space.

Ms. Callahan stated that the Board feels strongly that the need to see an engineering report that provides information addressing the structural stability of the building prior to entertaining an application for exterior changes to the building.

Minutes – Mr. Sanford made a motion to accept the minutes of the September 13, 2016 meeting as submitted. Mr. Alexander seconded the motion and a vote had the following results:

AYES: Callahan, MacMillan, Sanford, Mershon, Alexander Motion carried.

Respectfully submitted,

Teri L. Barown, RMC
Village Administrator